

# QUALITY IN FIVES

On the Analysis, Operationalization and Application of  
Nursing Schedule Quality

Johan H. Oldenkamp

Rijksuniversiteit Groningen

## QUALITY IN FIVES

On the Analysis, Operationalization  
and Application of Nursing Schedule Quality

### Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van het doctoraat in de  
Bedrijfskunde  
aan de Rijksuniversiteit Groningen  
op gezag van de  
Rector Magnificus Dr. F. van der Woude  
in het openbaar te verdedigen op  
donderdag 10 oktober 1996  
des namiddags te 2.45 uur

door

Johannes Hendrik Oldenkamp  
geboren op 5 november 1966  
te Groningen

Promotor

Prof. Dr. Ir. J.L. Simons

CIP-DATA KONINKLIJKE BIBLIOTHEEK, DEN HAAG

Oldenkamp, Johannes Hendrik

Quality in five; on the analysis, operationalization and application of nursing  
schedule quality / Johannes Hendrik Oldenkamp.

Capelle a/d IJssel: Labyrint Publication. - Ill.

Thesis Rijksuniversiteit Groningen. - With ref. - With summary in Dutch.

ISBN

Subject headings: nurse scheduling / decision support systems.

Layout: Henny Wever

Published by: LABYRINT PUBLICATION

P.O. Box 662

2900 AR Capelle a/d IJssel

The Netherlands

fax 31 (0) 10-451 97 94

Printed by: Ridderprint, Ridderkerk

Copyright © 1996, J.H. Oldenkamp

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reprinted or utilized in any form or by any electronic, mechanical or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or retrieval system, without prior written permission from the copyright owner.

Promotiecommissie (Dissertation Committee)

Prof. Dr. A.F. Casparie

Prof. Dr. K.B. Koster

Prof. Dr. A.H. van der Zwaan

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This thesis describes the results of a study on nurse scheduling conducted at the faculty of Management and Organization of the University of Groningen. Six health care organizations participated in this study, which are the university hospital of Groningen, the Groningen hospital 'Martini', the Zuidlaren psychiatric hospital 'Dennenoord', the Groningen nursing home 'Heijmanscentrum', the Winsum nursing home 'De Twaalf Hoven', and the Ermelo health care organization called 's Heeren Loo-Lozenoord'. I would like to thank everyone in one of these health care organizations who participated in this research or made this research possible. Especially, I would like to mention the nurse schedulers who participated in more than one of this study's research steps. These nurse schedulers are Alberta de Jonge, Rewinga Wierenga, Geessiena Wildeman, Lizet van Leeuwen, Gerda Yntema, Alma Noppers, Anke Vreema, Ineke de Groot, Reinolt Mulder and Meindert Kamp.

The research described in this thesis was conducted by the QUINS project. This project was supervised by my promotor John Simons. Without his efforts, this thesis would not have been written.

Two students played in an important role in this project. Martha Lettenga assisted in the research step described in chapter 5, and Hein Zelle wrote the additional software used in the final research step described in chapter 7. I am both Martha and Hein grateful for their help.

This research used the ZKR scheduling support system to do several experiments. This system was supplied by IKS Produkten (see also Appendix C). I would like to thank Jacques Boersma and Erik Huisman for their cooperation with the QUINS project.

Several others also contributed to this research. I would like to thank Rob de Bruin for writing a computer program in FORTRAN for the analysis of a part of this study's research results and for commenting on the corresponding part of chapter 6. I also would like to thank several of my former colleagues at the Faculty of Management and Organization for commenting on parts of this

study or previous publications based on this study. These former colleagues are Dieta Mietus, Ad Breukel, Sven van der Zee, Henk Gazendam, Bert de Brock, Han Numan, Hans van den Broek, Vincent Homburg, Margriet Offereins, Hen van de Water and Derk Jan Kiewiet.

Furthermore, I am very grateful to Henny Wever. Without her tremendous help, the layout of this thesis would have been quite different.

Although most of their contribution is still to come, I would also like to thank my paranymphs: Kees Tijs and Constantijn Heesen.

Also I would like to thank the members of my dissertation committee, professor Van der Zwaan, professor Koster and professor Casparie, for their comments on this thesis.

Finally I would like thank my parents, Henk and Ria Oldenkamp, my wife, Monique Oldenkamp, and also Jan and Hil Bremer, my uncle and aunt. Without their support and stimulation, I would not have been able to even start writing this thesis.

Johan H. Oldenkamp  
Groningen, The Netherlands  
July 1996

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of figures and tables .....	vi
----------------------------------	----

## PART I: INTRODUCTION

1	Quality of nursing schedules .....	3
1.1	Nursing management .....	3
1.1.1	Policies and planning of nurses and patients .....	4
1.1.2	Levels of planning .....	5
1.1.3	Definitions of nurse scheduling .....	5
1.1.4	Consequences of nursing schedules .....	6
1.2	Pluriformity of nursing schedule quality .....	9
1.2.1	The nurses' view on nursing schedule quality .....	9
1.2.2	The patients' view on nursing schedule quality .....	10
1.2.3	The management view on nursing schedule quality .....	10
1.2.4	The nurse scheduler's view on nursing schedule quality .....	11
1.3	Decision support for nurse scheduling .....	11
1.3.1	Influences on nurse scheduling .....	11
1.3.2	The quality chain of nurse scheduling support systems .....	12
1.3.3	Difficulty in solving the nurse scheduling problem .....	14
1.4	Preliminary research questions .....	16
1.5	Thesis outline .....	16

## PART II: THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

2	Approaches to supporting nurse scheduling .....	21
2.1	Theoretical quality aspects of nursing schedules .....	21
2.1.1	Facilitation of high-quality nursing care .....	22
2.1.2	Facilitation of efficient nursing care .....	23
2.1.3	Facilitation of job satisfaction .....	23

2.1.4	Supporting multiple views on nursing schedule quality	24
2.2	Nurse scheduling support systems	24
2.2.1	Exhaustive search for optimal schedules	27
2.2.2	Search for cyclic schedules	28
2.2.3	Heuristic search for feasible schedules	29
2.2.4	Knowledge-based search for good schedules	30
2.2.5	Data management for nurse scheduling	31
2.2.6	Interactive scheduling	31
2.2.7	Self scheduling	32
2.2.8	Conclusions of the comparison	33
2.3	The approach of quality indication scheduling	34
2.3.1	Assumption of formalization	34
2.3.2	Assumption of robustness	35
2.3.3	Assumption of effectiveness	36

### PART III: METHODOLOGY

3	Methodological foundation of the research approach	39
3.1	Research question and hypotheses	39
3.1.1	Hypothesis of formalization	41
3.1.2	Hypothesis of robustness	41
3.1.3	Hypothesis of effectiveness	42
3.1.4	Research questions	42
3.2	Research design	43
3.2.1	Questionnaire	44
3.2.2	Ranking experiment	45
3.2.3	Auditing experiment	47
3.2.4	Scheduling experiment	48

### PART IV: EMPIRICAL RESULTS

4	Quality factors of nursing schedules	53
4.1	Candidates for quality factors	53
4.2	Analysis of the candidates	56

---

4.2.1	Analysis on perceivability	56
4.2.2	Analysis on independence	56
4.2.3	Working set of quality factors	57
4.3	Validation of the quality factors	58
4.3.1	Definition phrases referring to completeness	59
4.3.2	Definition phrases referring to optimality	62
4.3.3	Definition phrases referring to proportionality	62
4.3.4	Definition phrases referring to healthiness	64
4.3.5	Definition phrases referring to continuity	65
4.3.6	Remaining phrases	66
4.3.7	Conclusions of the qualitative factor analysis	66
4.4	Final set of quality factors	67
5	Ranking of shift patterns	71
5.1	Characteristics of a nursing unit	71
5.1.1	Levels of nursing expertise	72
5.1.2	Length of schedule period	72
5.1.3	Types of working days	72
5.1.4	Quantitative staffing demands	73
5.2	Design of the ranking experiment	73
5.2.1	Decision aspects concerning completeness	74
5.2.2	Decision aspects concerning optimality	75
5.2.3	Decision aspects concerning proportionality	75
5.2.4	Decision aspects concerning healthiness	77
5.2.5	Decision aspects concerning continuity	79
5.3	Results of the ranking experiment	80
5.3.1	Rankings of shift patterns concerning completeness	81
5.3.2	Rankings of shift patterns concerning optimality	82
5.3.3	Rankings of shift patterns concerning proportionality	82
5.3.4	Rankings of shift patterns concerning healthiness	83
5.3.5	Rankings of shift patterns concerning continuity	84
5.4	Conclusions of the ranking experiment	84
5.5	Operationalization of the quality factors	85
5.5.1	Indication of completeness	85
5.5.2	Indication of optimality	87
5.5.3	Indication of proportionality	88
5.5.4	Indication of healthiness	89

5.5.5 Indication of continuity .....	90
5.5.6 Discussion of the operationalizations .....	91

---

6	Auditing of nursing schedules	93
6.1	Design of the auditing experiment	93
6.2	Results of the auditing experiment	97
6.2.1	Determination of summation weights	97
6.2.2	Goodness of fit	99
6.2.3	Coping with differences in marking style	102
6.3	Conclusions of the auditing experiment	104
7	Effective decision support for nurse scheduling	107
7.1	Design of the scheduling experiment	107
7.1.1	Steps of the scheduling experiment	108
7.1.2	Variables of the scheduling experiment	108
7.1.3	Characteristics of the East-5 nursing unit	110
7.1.4	Characteristics of the initial schedule	111
7.2	Results of the scheduling experiment	113
7.2.1	Values of the original final schedules	113
7.2.2	Values of the new final schedules	119
7.2.3	Randomized pre-test post-test control group design	121
7.3	Conclusions of the scheduling experiment	127

## PART V: CONCLUSIONS

8	Analysis, operationalization, and application of nursing schedule quality	131
8.1	Analysis of nursing schedule quality	132
8.2	Operationalization of nursing schedule quality	132
8.3	Application of nursing schedule quality	134
8.4	Conclusions	134
8.5	Generality of the results	135
8.6	Future research	136
8.6.1	Nursing schedule quality in practice	136
8.6.2	Run-time quality indication	137
8.6.3	Flexible support of nurse scheduling	138

References .....	139
Appendices	
Appendix A Questionnaire .....	149
Appendix B Rankings of the shift patterns .....	153
Appendix C The ZKR scheduling support system .....	199
Appendix D Reference case study .....	201
Summary .....	207
Samenvatting (Summary in Dutch) .....	213
Curriculum vitae .....	218

## LIST OF FIGURES AND TABLES

Figure 1.1	Policies and planning of nurses and patients .....	4
Figure 1.2	A nursing schedule .....	7
Figure 1.3	Consequences of nursing schedules for the performance of the nursing unit .....	8
Figure 1.4	Influences on nurse scheduling .....	12
Figure 1.5	The quality chain of nurse scheduling support systems .....	13
Figure 1.6	Cycle of developing decision support .....	14
Figure 1.7	Structure of this thesis .....	17
Figure 3.1	Four hierarchical layers of nursing schedule quality .....	40
Figure 3.2	The first empirical cycle of the research design .....	45
Figure 3.3	The second empirical cycle of the research design .....	47
Figure 3.4	The third empirical cycle of the research design .....	49
Figure 3.5	The fourth empirical cycle of the research design .....	50
Figure 4.1	The working set of quality factors .....	57
Figure 4.2	Research steps taken to find the five factors of nursing schedule quality .....	68
Figure 4.3	Final set of quality factors of nursing schedules .....	69
Figure 7.1	Steps of the scheduling experiment .....	109
Figure 7.2	The initial schedule used in the scheduling experiment .....	112
Figure 7.3	The original final schedule arranged by nurse scheduler number five .....	118
Figure 7.4	The new final schedule rearranged by nurse scheduler number five .....	124
Figure C.1	Representation of a nursing schedule in the ZKR program .....	200
Figure D.1	The less flexible initial schedule used in the additional case study .....	203
Figure D.2	The arranged original final schedule .....	204
Figure D.3	The rearranged new final schedule .....	205

Table 2.1	Theoretical quality aspects of nursing schedules .....	22
Table 2.2	Approaches to supporting nurse scheduling .....	25
Table 2.3	Comparison of approaches to supporting nurse scheduling ...	33
Table 4.1	The eight goals of nurse scheduling .....	54
Table 4.2a	The eighteen definitions of nursing schedule quality .....	60
Table 4.2b	The eighteen definitions of nursing schedule quality .....	61
Table 4.3	Definition phrases referring to the completeness factor .....	62
Table 4.4	Definition phrases referring to the optimality factor .....	63
Table 4.5	Definition phrases referring to the proportionality factor ....	63
Table 4.6	Definition phrases referring to the healthiness factor .....	64
Table 4.7	Definition phrases referring to the continuity factor .....	65
Table 4.8	Definition phrases referring to imperceivable aspects of nursing schedules .....	66
Table 5.1	Decision aspects of completeness .....	75
Table 5.2	Decision aspects of optimality .....	76
Table 5.3	Decision aspects of proportionality .....	77
Table 5.4	Decision aspects of healthiness .....	78
Table 5.5	Decision aspects of continuity .....	79
Table 5.6	Coefficients of concordance per quality factor per decision aspect .....	81
Table 5.7	Required number of staff members per type of shift ( $n_{ij}$ ) ....	86
Table 5.8	Required number of registered nurses per type of shift ( $l_{ij}$ ) ...	88
Table 5.9	Unhealthy shift patterns .....	90
Table 5.10	Meaning of shift codes .....	90
Table 6.1	Number of arranged nursing schedules per number of unacceptable factor .....	94
Table 6.2	Indication of the factor values of the fifteen fictitious nursing schedules .....	95
Table 6.3	Correlation coefficients for the factor values .....	96
Table 6.4	Probabilities of non-correlation .....	97
Table 6.5	Quality marks given by the nurse schedulers ( $Q_{s,i}$ ) .....	98
Table 6.6	Summation weights per nurse scheduler .....	99
Table 6.7	Predicted quality marks ( $Q^p_{s,i}$ ) .....	100
Table 6.8	Mean marking scores and the standard deviation per nurse scheduler .....	101
Table 6.9	Linearly transformed quality marks ( $Q^n_{s,i}$ ) .....	102
Table 6.10	New summation weights per nurse scheduler .....	103
Table 6.11	Predicted linearly transformed quality marks ( $Q^p_{s,i}$ ) .....	105

---

Table 7.1	Characteristics of the East-5 nursing staff .....	110
Table 7.2	Average number of annual working days .....	111
Table 7.3	Factor values of the original final schedules .....	114
Table 7.4	Total scheduling time in the traditional situation .....	115
Table 7.5a	Numbers of occurrences of low-quality schedule patterns in original final schedules .....	116
Table 7.5b	Numbers of occurrences of low-quality schedule patterns in original final schedules .....	117
Table 7.6	Summarized number of low-quality schedule patterns per quality factor in original final schedules .....	119
Table 7.7	Factor values of the new final schedules .....	120
Table 7.8	Total scheduling time in the new situation .....	121
Table 7.9a	Numbers of occurrences of low-quality schedule patterns in new final schedules .....	122
Table 7.9b	Numbers of occurrences of low-quality schedule patterns in new final schedules .....	123
Table 7.10	Summarized number of low-quality schedule patterns per quality factor in new final schedules .....	125
Table 7.11	Results of the first pre-test post-test control group design ...	125
Table 7.12	Results of the second pre-test post-test control group design .....	126
Table B.1	Combination decision about completeness on normal working days (C-1) .....	166
Table B.2	Combination decision about completeness on special working days (C-2) .....	167
Table B.3	Combination decision about completeness per type of working day (C-3) .....	168
Table B.4	Decision aspect of day shift optimality on normal working days (O-1) .....	169
Table B.5	Decision aspect of evening shift optimality on normal working days (O-2) .....	170
Table B.6	Decision aspect of night shift optimality on normal working days (O-3) .....	171
Table B.7	Combination decision about optimality on normal working days per type of shift (O-4) .....	172

Table B.8	Decision aspect of day shift optimality on special working days (O-5) .....	173
Table B.9	Decision aspect of evening shift optimality on special working days (O-6) .....	174
Table B.10	Decision aspect of night shift optimality on special working days (O-7) .....	175
Table B.11	Combination decision about optimality on special working days per type of shift (O-8) .....	176
Table B.12	Combination decision about optimality per type of working day (O-9) .....	177
Table B.13	Decision aspect of proportionality concerning the numbers per type of shift (P-1) .....	178
Table B.14	Decision aspect of proportionality concerning the distribution of days off (P-2) .....	179
Table B.15	Decision aspect of proportionality concerning the distribution of weekends off (P-3) .....	180
Table B.16	Combination decision about the importance per decision aspect concerning proportionality (P-4) .....	181
Table B.17	Decision aspect of healthiness concerning the number of consecutive night shifts (H-1) .....	186
Table B.18a	Decision aspect of healthiness concerning the number of consecutive evening shifts (H-2) .....	182
Table B.18b	Decision aspect of healthiness concerning the number of consecutive evening shifts (H-2); re-interpretation of given rankings by clustering four items ( $g + h + i + j \rightarrow g$ ) .....	183
Table B.19a	Decision aspect of healthiness concerning the number of consecutive day shifts (H-3) .....	184
Table B.19b	Decision aspect of healthiness concerning the number of consecutive day shifts (H-3); re-interpretation of given rankings by clustering four items ( $g + h + i + j \rightarrow g$ ) .....	185
Table B.20	Decision aspect of healthiness concerning the number of consecutive working days (H-4) .....	187
Table B.21	Combination decision about the importance per decision aspect concerning healthiness of consecutive shifts (H-5) ...	188
Table B.22	Decision aspect of healthiness concerning the amount of resting time after a period of night shifts (H-6) .....	189
Table B.23	Decision aspect of healthiness concerning the amount	

---

	of resting time between a change of shift without days off (H-7) .....	190
Table B.24	Decision aspect of healthiness concerning the amount of resting time between a change of shift with days off (H-8) .....	191
Table B.25	Combination decision about the importance per decision aspect concerning healthiness of scheduled resting time (H-9) .....	192
Table B.26	Combination decision about the importance of healthiness of consecutive shifts versus healthiness scheduled resting time (H-10) .....	193
Table B.27	Decision aspect of continuity during night shifts (T-1) .....	194
Table B.28	Decision aspect of continuity during evening shifts (T-2) ...	195
Table B.29	Decision aspect of continuity during day shifts (T-3) .....	196
Table B.30	Combination decision about the importance of continuity per type of shift (T-4) .....	197
Table D.1	Factor values of the original schedule .....	201
Table D.2	Numbers of occurrences of low-quality patterns in the original final schedule .....	202