

Models of Economic Geography  
*Dynamics, Estimation and Policy Evaluation*

Thijs Knaap

Publisher: Labyrint Publications  
Postbus 334  
2984 AX Ridderkerk  
The Netherlands  
Tel: 0180-463962

Printed by:  Offsetdrukkerij Ridderprint B.V., Ridderkerk.

ISBN 90-5335-025-X

© 2004 Thijs Knaap

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system of any nature, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, now known or hereafter invented, including photocopying or recording, without the prior written permission of the publisher.



Rijksuniversiteit Groningen

Models of Economic Geography:  
*Dynamics, Estimation and Policy Evaluation*

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van het doctoraat in de  
Economische Wetenschappen  
aan de Rijksuniversiteit Groningen  
op gezag van de  
Rector Magnificus, dr. F. Zwarts,  
in het openbaar te verdedigen op  
donderdag 1 april 2004  
om 16.15 uur

door

Thijs Knaap

geboren op 8 april 1972  
te Oldenzaal

Promotores: Prof. dr. S. Brakman  
Prof. dr. mr. C.J. Jepma

Beoordelingscommissie: Prof. dr. J. V. Henderson  
Prof. dr. J.P. Neary  
Prof. dr. J. Oosterhaven

# Acknowledgements

Work on this thesis started in 1996, when I was appointed to the department of economics at Groningen University. The project has continued much longer than any of the original participants must have thought, but I think it has now come to a satisfying conclusion.

After using eight years to write this relatively small book, I think I owe the public some explanation about how the time on this project was spent. I left Groningen late 2000 after completing the research that was to become chapter 6 of this thesis. The manuscript still had a number of loose ends, which I intended to tie up quickly.

As these things go, however, I was soon torn between two interesting projects: while my new job took off, theoretical complications that I had not foreseen turned up in several chapters of this book. Lacking the time to fix things once and for all, I soon became the owner of an interesting collection of missed deadlines. Fortunately, time was partly on my side. I came across a new paper by Redding and Venables in the summer of 2002 in which I found the missing idea for chapter 5. Dutch speakers will appreciate the fact that this paper saved my thesis. If I add that my experience in Rotterdam allowed me to improve the general-equilibrium models in this book I hope that the long time to completion is accounted for.

As with any drawn-out project, a large number of people have been instrumental to its completion. By naming a few of them here, I run the risk of neglecting others. For this I apologize beforehand.

I thank Steven Brakman for suggesting the project and subsequently allowing it to take a number of surprising turns. Our many discussions on the subject have been interesting and taught me a thing or two about keeping an eye on the subject while cutting the right corners. I further thank Catrinus Jepma for supervising the project and tirelessly reading manuscript after manuscript, suggesting many valuable improvements along the way. Both my promotors have shown an extraordinary amount of confidence in my abilities, and I hope that I have not let them down. Simon Kuipers contributed much to the smooth start of this project and involved me in many department activities, for which I am grateful. His valuable suggestions have especially improved chapters 2 and 3.

The members of my commission have certainly behaved above and be-

yond the call of duty. Professor Vernon Henderson showed remarkable hospitality by letting me visit Brown University for two wonderful months while I worked on chapter 5 in early 2000. The visit allowed me access to people and data that I could not otherwise have had, while exposing me to the interesting experience of winter in Rhode Island. Professor J. Peter Neary spotted a few glaring omissions and offered a large number of suggestions that have greatly improved the manuscript in its final stages. His careful reading of the entire book is appreciated. With Jan Oosterhaven I spent the summer of 2000 on the project that led to chapter 6. Working night and day to finish our model proved a good lesson in efficiency and dedication. However, the most valuable lesson came after those warm months and showed me the value of caring for your model once the computations are done. Without Jan's neverending enthusiasm, the results in chapter 6 might not have been given the attention they deserved.

Other people have directly contributed to this project, and I thank them for their work: Gordon Hanson kindly looked at a draft of chapter 5 in its early stages. Duncan Black supplied much of the data for that chapter. Ward Romp made figure 6.2. Piet Rietveld commented extensively on the original research proposal. As usual, the blame for any harm caused by this book falls on me alone.

While a graduate student, my work was made easier by the courses and workshops offered by the Dutch network of general and quantitative economics, NAKE. I gratefully acknowledge the help I received from many of its participants.

During recent years, my colleagues at Erasmus University repeatedly allowed me to take time off in order to finish this book. At the same time, their insights into general equilibrium modelling made it much better. I therefore include Leon Bettendorf, Lans Bovenberg, Peter Broer and Ben Heijdra here and thank them for their patience.

Whether I was a student, a faculty member or someone with a thesis to hand in, the department of Economics in Groningen has always treated me well. A special mention goes to my roommates Hakan Yetkiner and Marco Haan, my colleagues in International Economics, to the best computer services department in the world, to Philipp Maier for running a marathon with me, and to Steven Brakman, Ruud Koning, Elmer Sterken and Cees Sterks for accompanying me on various other distances.

Finally, all this work would not have been possible without the support and encouragement of those I hold dear: I thank my parents for their unconditional faith in my abilities and I especially thank Marianne Scholtens, who was there from start to finish, and I promise to honor her claim to the free time that now hopefully befalls me.

# Contents

<b>List of Tables</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>List of Figures</b>	<b>xiii</b>
<b>1 Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 The purpose of this book . . . . .	1
1.2 The final frontier . . . . .	3
1.3 Outline . . . . .	6
<b>2 Complementarities in growth and location theories</b>	<b>9</b>
2.1 Introduction . . . . .	9
2.2 Complementarities and the monopolistic competition frame- work . . . . .	12
2.2.1 Returns to scale . . . . .	14
2.2.2 Monopolistic competition . . . . .	16
2.2.3 Complementarities . . . . .	18
2.2.4 Review, and a look ahead . . . . .	20
2.3 Economic geography . . . . .	20
2.3.1 Exogenous agglomeration . . . . .	20
2.3.2 Endogenous agglomeration . . . . .	21
2.3.3 The CP model and the home market effect . . . . .	24
2.3.4 Three channels in the CP model . . . . .	26
2.3.5 Conclusion . . . . .	29
2.4 Endogenous growth theory . . . . .	30
2.4.1 Neoclassical and endogenous models of accumulation	31
2.4.2 Growth through innovation . . . . .	37
2.4.3 Empirical tests . . . . .	40
2.4.4 Review . . . . .	41
2.5 Dynamic economic geography . . . . .	41
2.5.1 Agglomeration through local knowledge spillovers .	42
2.5.2 Agglomeration through the R&D sector . . . . .	44
2.5.3 Agglomeration through the labor market . . . . .	45
2.5.4 Other models of growth and geography . . . . .	45

2.6	Conclusions . . . . .	47
2.A	A continuum of goods . . . . .	48
2.B	The home market effect . . . . .	49
2.C	The break and sustain point . . . . .	51
<b>3</b>	<b>A model with continuous sectors</b>	<b>55</b>
3.1	Generalized Monopolistic Competition . . . . .	56
3.1.1	An example . . . . .	57
3.2	A two-sector model of economic geography . . . . .	62
3.2.1	Sectors that only use their own product . . . . .	63
3.2.2	Other IO patterns . . . . .	66
3.3	Location, sectors and economic growth . . . . .	68
3.3.1	Introduction . . . . .	68
3.3.2	The spatial equilibrium . . . . .	71
3.3.3	Growth . . . . .	73
3.4	Conclusion . . . . .	75
3.A	Firm demand and supply . . . . .	76
<b>4</b>	<b>Input-output relations in economic geography</b>	<b>79</b>
4.1	Introduction . . . . .	79
4.1.1	Related theory . . . . .	80
4.1.2	Intermediate goods, trade, and ties between industries	81
4.1.3	Plan for the chapter . . . . .	85
4.2	The Venables model, and an extension with discrete sectors .	85
4.2.1	One industrial sector . . . . .	85
4.2.2	Types and determinants of equilibrium . . . . .	92
4.2.3	A model with discrete sectors . . . . .	96
4.2.4	Solving the model . . . . .	99
4.3	Types of solutions . . . . .	100
4.3.1	A Taxonomy . . . . .	100
4.3.2	Stability of equilibria . . . . .	102
4.4	Conclusions . . . . .	104
<b>5</b>	<b>Estimation of parameters</b>	<b>107</b>
5.1	Introduction . . . . .	107
5.2	Estimation in the literature . . . . .	109
5.2.1	Measuring the home market effect . . . . .	110
5.2.2	Estimating a spatial wage structure . . . . .	111
5.2.3	Model calibration . . . . .	113
5.3	Vertically linked industries and agglomeration . . . . .	113
5.4	Data . . . . .	119
5.5	Estimation . . . . .	121
5.5.1	The Redding-Venables approach . . . . .	121
5.5.2	General equilibrium estimation . . . . .	133

5.6	Evaluating counterfactuals . . . . .	140
5.6.1	A wage shock . . . . .	140
5.6.2	A fall in transport costs . . . . .	142
5.7	Conclusions . . . . .	143
5.A	Data . . . . .	144
<b>6</b>	<b>Evaluating a new Dutch railway link</b>	<b>157</b>
6.1	Introduction . . . . .	157
6.2	The Model . . . . .	159
6.2.1	Production and Utility . . . . .	159
6.2.2	The Labor Market . . . . .	162
6.2.3	Transport Costs and Prices . . . . .	162
6.2.4	Computation . . . . .	164
6.3	Estimation and Calibration . . . . .	164
6.3.1	Procedure and Data . . . . .	164
6.3.2	Problems with the estimation . . . . .	166
6.3.3	Estimation results . . . . .	167
6.3.4	Calibration . . . . .	168
6.4	Simulation Results . . . . .	169
6.4.1	Some remarks . . . . .	169
6.4.2	Endogenous number of varieties . . . . .	170
6.4.3	Figures . . . . .	171
6.5	Evaluation . . . . .	172
6.6	Conclusion . . . . .	173
6.A	Data and Conventions . . . . .	174
6.A.1	Division of the Economy . . . . .	174
6.A.2	Available Data . . . . .	175
6.A.3	Other Coefficients . . . . .	176
6.B	Derivations . . . . .	177
6.B.1	Costs and Production functions . . . . .	177
6.B.2	The number of firms . . . . .	178
<b>7</b>	<b>Summary and conclusions</b>	<b>181</b>
7.1	Summary . . . . .	181
7.2	Conclusions . . . . .	185
	<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>189</b>
	<b>Samenvatting</b>	<b>201</b>



# List of Tables

1.1	Indicators of the differences in the intensity of economic activity on different scales. . . . .	2
5.1	Gravity equations . . . . .	120
5.2	Panel estimates for the gravity trade equation . . . . .	146
5.3	Market Access and wage levels . . . . .	147
5.4	Supplier Access and wage levels . . . . .	149
5.5	Exogenous amenities, Market Access and wage levels . . . . .	150
5.6	Instrumental variables estimation . . . . .	151
5.7	Factor shares in US production, 1997 . . . . .	152
5.8	General equilibrium estimation results . . . . .	153
5.9	Effects of a 10% decrease in Illinois wages . . . . .	155
5.10	Effects of a 50% decrease in of transport costs between Illinois and Indiana . . . . .	156
6.1	Estimates of the unknown parameters $\Gamma$ as obtained from a non-linear least squares procedure . . . . .	167
6.2	The change in employment in two cities after a project, in seven iterations of the model. The number of firms varies endogenously. . . . .	170
6.3	Change in the number of jobs per region after each of five project alternatives . . . . .	171
6.4	Change in the price index of consumption for the average consumer . . . . .	171
6.5	The fourteen different sectors in the economy . . . . .	174
6.6	Six scenarios for travel time in 2020, each with a different infrastructural prject completed . . . . .	176
6.7	Exogenous coefficients for each sector . . . . .	177



# List of Figures

1.1	A nighttime picture of London . . . . .	5
2.1	GDP per capita in the Netherlands . . . . .	10
2.2	Gross regional product for twelve Dutch provinces . . . . .	11
2.3	Direction of motion of $k$ in two models of growth . . . . .	32
2.4	A box-arrow sketch of the two-sector model . . . . .	33
3.1	Function $f(x)$ in formula (3.13) mapped out. . . . .	60
3.2	Function $f(x)$ in formula (3.17) mapped out. . . . .	62
3.3	Sector 1 preferable region . . . . .	64
3.4	Sector 2 preferable region . . . . .	65
3.5	Direction of motion in the $(m_1, m_2)$ plane . . . . .	65
3.6	Dynamics when $\tau = 0.2$ . . . . .	66
3.7	The function $f(x)$ in formula (3.19) mapped out . . . . .	67
3.8	Direction of motion when sector 1 uses all output as intermediate, sector 2 uses only sector 2 output. . . . .	67
3.9	The function $f(x)$ in formula (3.20) mapped out. . . . .	68
3.10	The direction of motion when sectors use each others output as intermediate input. . . . .	69
3.11	Function $f(x)$ , as defined in formula (3.21). . . . .	70
3.12	Function $f(x)$ , defined in formula (3.21), when the number of firms grows from $n$ to $n + \delta$ . . . . .	74
4.1	Trade data for Germany in 1999, from and to OECD- and non-OECD countries. . . . .	82
4.2	Section 7 trade between the Netherlands and Germany . . . . .	84
4.3	Two lines that indicate the stability of two equilibria as a function of transport costs $\tau$ . . . . .	90
4.4	Stability as a function of transport costs $\tau$ when $\beta = 1$ . . . . .	93
4.5	Stability when $\psi = 0.1$ and labor is more expensive than intermediate products . . . . .	95
4.6	Stability when $\psi = 2.8$ and intermediate products are more expensive than labor . . . . .	95

4.7	Stability when $\psi = 20$ and intermediate products are much more expensive than labor . . . . .	95
4.8	A closeup look at figure 4.6 . . . . .	95
4.9	The four types of equilibrium, stylized . . . . .	102
4.10	Stability map for all possible IO-matrices . . . . .	103
4.11	A trip along the diagonal of the 'map figure' . . . . .	104
4.12	Stability map for all IO-matrices, different parameters . . . . .	105
5.1	The 48 contiguous states in the US . . . . .	121
5.2	Predicted Market Access versus log wages for 48 states. . . . .	148
5.3	Predicted Foreign M.A. versus log wages for 48 states. . . . .	148
5.4	Distribution of the angle between the two vectors $dT/d\sigma$ and $dT/d\tau$ . . . . .	152
5.5	MC distribution of $\hat{\sigma}$ , 'export' estimation, 1/40 errors . . . . .	154
5.6	MC distribution of $\hat{\tau}$ , 'export' estimation, 1/40 errors . . . . .	154
5.7	MC distribution of $\hat{\delta}$ , 'export' estimation, 1/40 errors . . . . .	154
6.1	Predicted log-trade versus actual log-trade . . . . .	167
6.2	The effect of the six scenarios on the number of jobs in each COROP region. . . . .	179